



Slum upgrading and Inclusive planning

David Satterthwaite, International Institute for
Environment and Development (IIED)

Upgrading and inclusion

- ▶ Upgrading has become a conventional response to informal settlements
- ▶ Now a 50 year history
- ▶ Less bulldozing
- ▶ Some upgrading - isolated examples; others part of national policies
- ▶ See also major city initiatives to extend piped water sewers and drains to informal settlements that are not counted as upgrading

Forms of upgrading

- ▶ Upgrading that is actually eviction
- ▶ Rudimentary upgrading
- ▶ More complete upgrading
- ▶ Comprehensive upgrading
- ▶ Comprehensive community-led upgrading
- ▶ Comprehensive community-led upgrading with resilience lens
- ▶ Transformative upgrading

Different forms of informal settlement upgrading

Forms of upgrading	What it involves
<i>Upgrading that is actually eviction</i>	Pushing residents out to rebuild; residents not able to access 'upgraded' dwellings
<i>Rudimentary upgrading</i>	Very basic interventions – e.g. community taps
<i>More complete upgrading</i>	Piped water and toilets in each home, electricity, paved access roads .. Little consultation with residents.
<i>Comprehensive upgrading</i>	Legal land title, full range of infrastructure and services. Support for house improvement and for enterprises. Consultation with residents.
<i>Comprehensive community-led upgrading</i>	As above but with community control as in upgrading supported by CODI and SDI affiliates
<i>Comprehensive community-led upgrading with resilience lens</i>	As above but with greater attention to assessing and anticipating future risk levels
<i>Transformative upgrading</i>	As above with attention to low carbon footprint added

Different forms of informal settlement upgrading

Forms of upgrading	What it involves
<i>Upgrading that is actually eviction</i>	Pushing residents out to rebuild; residents not able to access 'upgraded' dwellings
<i>Rudimentary upgrading</i>	Very basic interventions – e.g. community taps
<i>More complete upgrading</i>	Piped water and toilets in each home, electricity, paved access roads .. Little consultation with residents.
<i>Comprehensive upgrading</i>	Legal land title, full range of infrastructure and services. Support for house improvement and for enterprises. Consultation with residents.
<i>Comprehensive community-led upgrading</i>	As above but with community control as in upgrading supported by CODI and SDI affiliates
<i>Comprehensive community-led upgrading with resilience lens</i>	As above but with greater attention to assessing and anticipating future risk levels
<i>Transformative upgrading</i>	As above with attention to low carbon footprint added

Different forms of informal settlement upgrading

Forms of upgrading	What it involves
<i>Upgrading that is actually eviction</i>	Pushing residents out to rebuild; residents not able to access 'upgraded' dwellings
<i>Rudimentary upgrading</i>	Very basic interventions – e.g. community taps
<i>More complete upgrading</i>	Piped water and toilets in each home, electricity, paved access roads .. Little consultation with residents.
<i>Comprehensive upgrading</i>	Legal land title, full range of infrastructure and services. Support for house improvement and for enterprises. Consultation with residents.
<i>Comprehensive community-led upgrading</i>	As above but with community control as in upgrading supported by CODI and SDI affiliates
<i>Comprehensive community-led upgrading with resilience lens</i>	As above but with greater attention to assessing and anticipating future risk levels
<i>Transformative upgrading</i>	As above with attention to low carbon footprint added

Different forms of informal settlement upgrading

Forms of upgrading	What it involves
<i>Upgrading that is actually eviction</i>	Pushing residents out to rebuild; residents not able to access 'upgraded' dwellings
<i>Rudimentary upgrading</i>	Very basic interventions – e.g. community taps
<i>More complete upgrading</i>	Piped water and toilets in each home, electricity, paved access roads .. Little consultation with residents.
<i>Comprehensive upgrading</i>	Legal land title, full range of infrastructure and services. Support for house improvement and for enterprises. Consultation with residents.
<i>Comprehensive community-led upgrading</i>	As above but with community control as in upgrading supported by CODI and SDI affiliates
<i>Comprehensive community-led upgrading with resilience lens</i>	As above but with greater attention to assessing and anticipating future risk levels
<i>Transformative upgrading</i>	As above with attention to low carbon footprint added

Different forms of informal settlement upgrading

Forms of upgrading	What it involves
<i>Upgrading that is actually eviction</i>	Pushing residents out to rebuild; residents not able to access 'upgraded' dwellings
<i>Rudimentary upgrading</i>	Very basic interventions – e.g. community taps
<i>More complete upgrading</i>	Piped water and toilets in each home, electricity, paved access roads .. Little consultation with residents.
<i>Comprehensive upgrading</i>	Legal land title, full range of infrastructure and services. Support for house improvement and for enterprises. Consultation with residents.
<i>Comprehensive community-led upgrading</i>	As above but with community control as in upgrading supported by CODI and SDI affiliates
<i>Comprehensive community-led upgrading with resilience lens</i>	As above but with greater attention to assessing and anticipating future risk levels
<i>Transformative upgrading</i>	As above with attention to low carbon footprint added

Different forms of informal settlement upgrading

Forms of upgrading	What it involves
<i>Upgrading that is actually eviction</i>	Pushing residents out to rebuild; residents not able to access 'upgraded' dwellings
<i>Rudimentary upgrading</i>	Very basic interventions – e.g. community taps
<i>More complete upgrading</i>	Piped water and toilets in each home, electricity, paved access roads .. Little consultation with residents.
<i>Comprehensive upgrading</i>	Legal land title, full range of infrastructure and services. Support for house improvement and for enterprises. Consultation with residents.
<i>Comprehensive community-led upgrading</i>	As above but with community control as in upgrading supported by CODI and SDI affiliates
<i>Comprehensive community-led upgrading with resilience lens</i>	As above but with greater attention to assessing and anticipating future risk levels
<i>Transformative upgrading</i>	As above with attention to low carbon footprint added

Different forms of informal settlement upgrading

Forms of upgrading	What it involves
<i>Upgrading that is actually eviction</i>	Pushing residents out to rebuild; residents not able to access 'upgraded' dwellings
<i>Rudimentary upgrading</i>	Very basic interventions – e.g. community taps
<i>More complete upgrading</i>	Piped water and toilets in each home, electricity, paved access roads .. Little consultation with residents.
<i>Comprehensive upgrading</i>	Legal land title, full range of infrastructure and services. Support for house improvement and for enterprises. Consultation with residents.
<i>Comprehensive community-led upgrading</i>	As above but with community control as in upgrading supported by CODI and SDI affiliates
<i>Comprehensive community-led upgrading with resilience lens</i>	As above but with greater attention to assessing and anticipating future risk levels
<i>Transformative upgrading</i>	As above with attention to low carbon footprint

Different forms of informal settlement upgrading

Forms of upgrading	What it involves
<i>Upgrading that is actually eviction</i>	Pushing residents out to rebuild; residents not able to access 'upgraded' dwellings
<i>Rudimentary upgrading</i>	Very basic interventions – e.g. community taps
<i>More complete upgrading</i>	Piped water and toilets in each home, electricity, paved access roads .. Little consultation with residents.
<i>Comprehensive upgrading</i>	Legal land title, full range of infrastructure and services. Support for house improvement and for enterprises. Consultation with residents.
<i>Comprehensive community-led upgrading</i>	As above but with community control as in upgrading supported by CODI and SDI affiliates
<i>Comprehensive community-led upgrading with resilience lens</i>	As above but with greater attention to assessing and anticipating future risk levels
<i>Transformative upgrading</i>	As above with attention to low carbon footprint added



Forms of upgrading	Government engagement with those to be upgraded
Upgrading that is actually eviction	Directed by government, usually implemented by contractors.
Rudimentary upgrading	As above. Usually with inadequate maintenance
More complete upgrading	As above. Often unclear where responsibility for this lies
Comprehensive upgrading	Strong government commitment mostly implemented by contractors. Settlements becomes 'formal' as city authorities provide policing, street lighting, solid waste collection..
Comprehensive community-led upgrading	Strong government support for community organizations; very inclusionary right from data collection and planning
Comprehensive community-led upgrading with resilience lens	Strong community-local government partnership for resilience;
Transformative upgrading	As above; support from national government







Forms of upgrading	Government engagement with those to be upgraded
Upgrading that is actually eviction	Directed by government, usually implemented by contractors.
Rudimentary upgrading	As above. Usually with inadequate maintenance
More complete upgrading	As above. Often unclear where responsibility for this lies
Comprehensive upgrading	Strong government commitment mostly implemented by contractors. Settlements becomes 'formal' as city authorities provide policing, street lighting, solid waste collection..
Comprehensive community-led upgrading	Strong government support for community organizations; very inclusionary right from data collection and planning
Comprehensive community-led upgrading with resilience lens	Strong community-local government partnership for resilience;
Transformative upgrading	As above; support from national government





Forms of upgrading	Government engagement with those to be upgraded
Upgrading that is actually eviction	Directed by government, usually implemented by contractors.
Rudimentary upgrading	As above. Usually with inadequate maintenance
More complete upgrading	As above. Often unclear where responsibility for this lies
Comprehensive upgrading	Strong government commitment mostly implemented by contractors. Settlements becomes 'formal' as city authorities provide policing, street lighting, solid waste collection..
Comprehensive community-led upgrading	Strong government support for community organizations; very inclusionary right from data collection and planning
Comprehensive community-led upgrading with resilience lens	Strong community-local government partnership for resilience;
Transformative upgrading	As above; support from national government





Forms of upgrading	Government engagement with those to be upgraded
Upgrading that is actually eviction	Directed by government, usually implemented by contractors.
Rudimentary upgrading	As above. Usually with inadequate maintenance
More complete upgrading	As above. Often unclear where responsibility for this lies
Comprehensive upgrading	Strong government commitment mostly implemented by contractors. Settlements becomes 'formal' as city authorities provide policing, street lighting, solid waste collection..
Comprehensive community-led upgrading	Strong government support for community organizations; very inclusionary right from data collection and planning
Comprehensive community-led upgrading with resilience lens	Strong community-local government partnership for resilience;
Transformative upgrading	As above; support from national government

Some examples

- ▶ The 32 slum/shack dweller organizations that make up Slum/shack Dwellers International have developed a capacity to undertake very detailed enumerations of informal settlements
- ▶ NOT EASILY DONE: no addresses, no street names.....hostility to interviewers
- ▶ . These then provide the information base for planning upgrading initiatives and for negotiating with local governments.

SDI community-driven enumerations

- ▶ They engage all residents so everyone knows what is being done
- ▶ They are done by residents guided by community leaders
- ▶ Their foundations are community savings groups; most savers and saving group managers are women
- ▶ The enumerations are very detailed
- ▶ They have space for respondents to give their priorities
- ▶ They report back the findings to residents that then generates more discussions
- ▶ They provide data that local governments need

Data collected by SDI enumerations

- ▶ One example: The Slum Dwellers Federation of Kenya - Muungano wa Wanavijiji - profiled nearly 221,000 residents in Kisumu's informal settlements
- ▶ Shows the depth and detail that community-led enumerations achieve

Data collected for water

- ▶ household's main water sources (9 possibilities)
- ▶ number of individual, community and shared taps; functionality and water quality
- ▶ expenditure on water
- ▶ time needed collect water
- ▶ water availability

Among other topics covered



Land ownership and history for each informal settlement

- Demographic and structure details
- Evictions
- Provision for sanitation, garbage collection, health care, electricity, education, transport
- Health
- Livelihoods

Commercial establishments, playgrounds, banks, informal markets, fire and police stations, mosques, temples, churches

- Organizations: community leaders and their roles
- Community priorities

Gobabis

- ▶ Community-led upgrading programme in Freedom Square.
- ▶ Led by the Shack Dwellers Federation of Namibia working with the Namibian Housing Action Group and municipal authorities
- ▶ Guided by community-led enumeration
- ▶ Local government allowed lower (cheaper) standards
- ▶ Upgrading costs were one-fifth conventional approaches so affordable to far more households

SOURCE: Delgado, G., Muller, A., Mabakeng, R., & Namupala, M. (2020). Co-producing land for housing through informal settlement upgrading: lessons from a Namibian municipality. *Environment and Urbanization*, 32(1), 175-194.

CODI

- ▶ Thailand's Community Organizations Development Institute (CODI) funds and supports community organizations formed by the inhabitants of informal settlements to plan and manage upgrading their settlement.
- ▶ More than 100,000 households have benefitted from this programme.

SOURCE: Boonyabancha, S. and Kerr, T. (2018), Lessons from CODI on co-production, *Environment and Urbanization*, 30, No. 2, 444-460

NAIROBI

- ▶ Upgrading programmes in Mukuru, one of Nairobi's largest informal settlements.
- ▶ Led by Kenyan Homeless People's Federation (Muungano wa Wanavijiji). Unusual in its scale (around 100,000 households), and its engagement with all stakeholders seeking to generate consensus – informed by enumerations

SOURCE: Lines, K. and Makau, J. (2018). Taking the long view: 20 years of Muungano wa Wanavijiji, the Kenyan federation of slum dwellers. *Environment and Urbanization*, 30(2) 407-424

Conclusions

- ▶ Upgrading if done well transforms housing and living conditions
- ▶ But successful examples of upgrading usually include (and depend on) much better relations between informal settlement dwellers and local government
- ▶ These usually include partnerships with local government; big pipes and small pipes
- ▶ Including all departments
- ▶ These changed relationships providing the foundation from which other exclusions can be addressed

Informal settlements and inclusion

- ▶ Inclusion in what:
 - ▶ In infrastructure systems (e.g. connection to water mains and paved roads)
 - ▶ Services (e.g. access to government schools)
- ▶ Governance
 - ▶ In informal settlement (representative community organizations)
 - ▶ At city scale; community organizations coming together to negotiate with and work with city government

Upgrading and inclusion

- ▶ Inclusion for whom?
- ▶ All residents? Inclusion of needs and priorities of women?? Immigrants? Vulnerable groups?
- ▶ Community organizations and leaders (how representative)
- ▶ Landlords
- ▶ Inclusion by what means